





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
	11.04.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8, OP-9, Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10, and OP-7	Subject: Bush 1 AC.xls Attachment: Bush 1 AC.xls Allotment for tenders due on 12/4/16	
	16.04.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-9, Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10, and OP-7	Subject: Bush 1 AC.xls Attachment: Bush 1 AC.xls	
	28.04.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8, OP-9, Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10, and OP-7	Subject: Bush 1 AC.xls Attachment: Bush 1 AC.xls	
	09.05.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-7, OP-9, Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP- 8, and Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10	Subject: Bush 1 AC.xls Attachment: Bush 1 AC.xls New Allotment of HPPA Bushes	Ms. Shanta Sohoni allocates tenders between the OPs and sends as attachment Price List Rates, allocation tables, and share of each party. She also indicates the percentage by which the non-allotties should quote higher than PLR.
1.	03.06.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Alok Somani and Mr. Amit Somani of OP-1/ OP-3, and OP-7	Subject: Bush allotment.xls Attachment: Bush allotment.xls As discussed, allotment of brake gear bushes is enclosed herewith.	
	03.06.2016	Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	Are these basic prices or all-inclusive prices	
	03.06.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Alok Somani and Mr. Amit Somani of OP-1/ OP-3, and OP-7	These are basic rates ED @ 6% extra + CST/VAT @ 5% or 5.5% extra whichever is applicable. Non-allotties will quote 7-8% higher than PLR.	
	17.06.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, and OP-7	Subject: Bush allotment.xls Attachment: Bush allotment.xls Due to oversight, we have quoted lower rate in SCR tender opened on 15/6/16. Therefore, we are sending herewith revised allotment for your further action	
	24.06.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, and	New Allotment with some changes for Bushes.	





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
		OP-7		
	24.06.2016	Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5, and OP-7	Dear Sir, This time qty/ set of SCR tender due on 27.06.16 is different than earlier tender opened on 15.06.16. Hence price should be Rs. 2,464/- instead of Rs. 1,335/ as mentioned in allocation sheet. Please check and revise the allocation sheet. Further please also do the allocation for ECOR Tender No. 03163779 due on 14.07.16 for 1550 sets.	
	24.06.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, Mr. Alok Somani and Mr. Amit Somani of OP-1/ OP-3, and OP-7	Subject: Bush allotment.xls Attachment: Bush allotment.xls Allotment of Bush with allotment of EcoR	
2.	23.05.2016	WhatsApp chat between Mr. Bhupesh Bafna of OP-2/ OP-4/ OP-5 and Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3	Bhupesh Bafna: Sir, any thoughts to my proposal Alok Somani: 4 shares for 4 approvals Bhupesh Bhupesh Bafna: Spoke to them. They are all suggesting 3 shares. I think its reasonable. But its your call Alok Somani: You need to convince them I am not being unreasonable Bhupesh Bafna: I have spoken to them a couple of times. We have the following on the approved list. BB, PPPL, JP, QUADRANT, MICRO, POLYMER Alok Somani: So what percentage of total are you proposing to me	WhatsApp chat in addition to above e-mails displays concerted action between Mr. Bhupesh Bafna and Mr. Alok Somani regarding sharing of market as per allocated shares in forthcoming tenders.
3.	27.06.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-7	ICF tender No. 02167323 due on 01/07/16 is allotted between Polyset & Jai Polypan PLR Rate is Rs. 4601/- Polyset will quote Rs. 4,600/- + ED @ 6% + CST @ 5% = Total Rs. 5,119.80 per set. JPPL is requested to quote Rs. 5,119.80 (all inclusive) Pl. confirm the same.	Ms. Shanta Sohoni allocates ICF tender between OP-5 and OP-7 and provides rates to be quoted.
4.	04.07.2016	Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 to OP-7	Dear Sir, We are quoting basic rate of Rs. 6,098.00 + ED @ 6% + CST @ 5% (Rs. 6,787.07 all incl.)	OP-3 and OP-7 are sharing prices to be quoted in





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
			in S. Rly tender due on 06.07.16. So JPPL to quote all-inclusive rate of Rs. 6,787.07. Please confirm the same.	Southern Railway forthcoming tender with
	04.07.2016	Mr. Rajesh Nair of OP-7 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	Dear Sir, Okay. We hereby confirm the rate all-inclusive rate of Rs. 6,787.07. Regards Rajesh Nair	each other and Ms. Shanta Sohoni is co-ordinating such exchange.
	04.07.2016	Mr. Rajesh Nair of OP-7 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	Mam, Pl. note that SR tender due on 6/07/2016 for 3300 sets allotted to BBC and JPPL with rate of Rs. 6098/- Basic. BBC is now quoting sales tax rate @ 5% whereas JPPL should quote 5.5% as per Government of Rajasthan, then there is a difference in the total rate. Pl. confirm what rate we have to quote on this tender? Whether it is all inclusive rate and also confirm from BBC for their rates. Pl. reply immediately. Also there is a confusion in ICF tender opened on 1/7/2016 as BBC rate is L2 Regards Rajesh Nair	
	04.07.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-7	Pl. discuss with BBC before quoting the rate.	
	04.07.2016	Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3 to OP-7	<ul> <li>Please note the following:-</li> <li>a) Tenders where HPPA/SLPR bushes are specified, we quote only for SLPR bushes and not for HPPA bushes</li> <li>b) Tender where only HPPA bushes are specified, we quote in BBC and are eligible for part 2 qtys which are out of scope of present arrangement.</li> </ul>	Ms. Shanta Sohoni clarifies to the OPs that cartel is only for tenders where both types of bushes – SLPR
5.	06.07.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3, and OP-7	Sir, We have understanding for P1 approved firms PPPL & PM = 2 firms for HPPA BBC & MFGP= 2 firms for SLPR JPPL = 1 firm or HPPA BBC firms cannot quote for tenders floated only for HPPA bushes and Polyset Group and JPPL cannot quote for tenders floated for SLPR bushes.	and HPPA are required. In reply, OP-7 states that pool for tenders for only HPPA Bushes should also be continued as it was between OP-7 and OP-5





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
			Therefore, henceforth, allotments will be done where both types of bushes are required in same tender. If requirement is for anyone type of bush i.e. HPPA or SLPR separately, those tenders will not be allotted and accounted for pool.  Pl. confirm.	previously. Ms. Shanta Sohoni agrees to the same stating that allocation shall
	06.07.2016	Mr. Rajesh Nair of OP-7 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	Mam, JPPL agrees in this matter. But if any tender for separate HPPA bushes, PPPL & JPPL should have pool and there should be a separate account and allocation for those tenders to avoid any underquote or misunderstanding. Earlier also PPPL & JPPL have such type of allocation arrangements and our suggestion is that we both (PPPL & JPPL) continue this arrangement in Part 1 category. Please Confirm, Regards Rajesh Nair,	be 33% share for each firm.
	06.07.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-7	Yes, then we will make separate account and ratio will be 2:1 i.e. 33% share to each firm	
	30.07.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-7	As per discussion had with Shri Rajiv, we are doing allotments between Jai Polypan and Polyset for HPPA Bushes Part I only. Ratio 2:1 (Polyset 2 firms and JPPL 1 firm) Any doubt, pl. discuss	OP-7 and Ms. Shanta Sohoni discuss that pool
6.	01.08.2016	Mr. Rajeev Dudhani of OP-7 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5  Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-7	Mam, OK. There should be separate account for HPPA & SLPR combined tenders. Regards Rajeev Dudhani	for combined HPPA/ SLPR tenders and for only HPPA tenders should be separate.
	01.08.2016	Ms. Snanta Sonom of OP-3 to OP-7	Yes, we will continue SLPR/ HPPA A/c. separately and HPPA A/c. separately.	Ma Chanta Cahani
7.	04.08.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, and OP-7	Subject: Allotment for New Bush tenders Attachments: Bush allotment.xls	Ms. Shanta Sohoni allocates tenders between the OPs and sends as attachment Price List Rates, allocation tables,





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
				and share of each party.
8.	19.08.2016	Mr. Rajesh Nair of OP-7 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	Mam, We will quote all-inclusive rate of Rs. 5,509.86 per set for NFR HPPA tender No. 30161001 due on 22/8/2016, in which JPPL & PPPL are equal ratio. Pl. confirm the same so that we can submit the BID. Thanks & Regards, Rajesh Nair	Mr. Rajesh Nair and Ms. Shanta Sohoni discuss about the prices to be quoted in North Western Railway tender that is to be
	20.08.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-7	You are requested to quote Rs. 5,509.85 all inclusive. Polyset will quote Rs. 4,950.45 per pc. + ED @ 6% + CST @ 5% = Rs. 5,509.85 per set	equally distributed between OP-5 and OP-7.
	06.09.2016	Ms. Rajesh Nair of OP-7 to Ms. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	Dear Sir, SCR Tender No. 30163695-C due on 9/9/2016 for 4876 sets allocated for BBC & JPPL equally. JPPL will quote all-inclusive of Rs. 2,755.49 per set (Basic + 6% + 5.5%) Kindly confirm the above all inclusive rate to upload the tender Thanks & Regards Rajesh Nair	Prices to be quoted in South Central Railway tender were discussed between OP-3 and OP-7. Then OP-3 informs Ms.
9.	06.09.2016	Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 to OP-7	Dear Sir,  OK then you quote Rs. 2,755.49 per set all inclusive. We will quote rate with break up as below:-  Basic - 2,475.73 + ED @ 6% + CST @ 5% (Rs. 2,755.49 all inclusive).	Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 that due to OP-5's mistake of quoting low prices, OP-3 is also being asked to quote lower during negotiations. He stated that OP-7 is the
	26.09.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni to Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3	This has reference to your SMS to Shri Bhupesh By mistake we have quoted Rate Rs. 2190/- per set + ED 6% + CST 5% and therefore we have accepted order for 1045 sets in Power Mould	
	26.09.2016	Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	In future, do not allot us SCR tenders for kits. Because of your mistake, we are also being asked to also reduce the rates. Now please advise JPPL who were the joint allotees for this tender regarding action to be taken when SCR calls for negotiations.	joint allottee for the stated tender; therefore, he should also be informed of the
	26.09.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-7	Pl. reply.	action to be taken during
	26.09.2016	OP-7 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	Mam, As such we have not received any call for negotiation from SCR for this tender. In future, if	negotiations called by the





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
			received we will inform you.  Regards  Rajeev Dudhani	Railways. Ms. Shanta Sohoni thus, informs OP-7 that as tender
	26.09.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-7	Pl. inform BBC because they are sharing this tender with you.  Secondly, due to our mistake, you should not accept lower rate and you can show your S.  Rly. Tender advance for getting your quoted rate.  Pl. discuss with Mr. Somani for the same.	is to be shared between OP-7 and OP-3, OP-7 may discuss with OP-3 accordingly, however, it need not reduce prices.
10.	13.10.2016	Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3 to OP-7	Power Mold had quoted rate Rs. 2,190/- per set + ED 6% + CST 5% in one of earlier tenders of SC Rly. Therefore, SC Rly has called for negotiation against tender opened on 9.9.16.  We would not be attending the negotiations and would be sending a letter to them offering them discount of Rs. 274/- on the basic rates. The quoted basic rate was Rs. 2.464/ Thus. after giving the above discount, our basic rate would become Rs. 2,190/- per set. ED @ 6% and CST @ 5% would be extra.  Jai Polypan to please confirm that they would be also be quoting as above.	OP-3 informs price that it will offer during negotiations to South Central Railway to OP-7
	13.10.2016	OP-7 to Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3	Okay. Agreed to send letter to SCR showing that our rate will be Rs. 2437.47 per set (inclusive of 6% ED & 5.5% Sales Tax) BBC rate will be Rs. 2190/ + 6% + 5% - 2437.47. it is correct sir,	and seeks confirmation from for the same.
	13.10.2016	Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3 to OP-7	Yes, it is correct	
11.	25.10.2016	Mr. Rajesh Nair of OP-7 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	Mam, P1. note that we will be quoting to WCR Tender due on 28/10/2016 Rs. 1,811.96 per set (all-inclusive i.e. basic + 6% + 5.5%) PPPL should quote basic 1,628 + 6% + 5% = 1,811.96 per set. P1. confirm the above as PPPL & JPPL are equally allotted. Thanks & Regards, Rajesh Nair	OP-7 informs Ms. Shanta Sohoni of the rates to be quoted in Western Central Railway tender as tender had been allocated equally





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
	25.10.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-7	o.k.	under cartel arrangement.
12.	03.11.2016	Ms. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5, OP-7, and Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP- 3	Subject: RE: Bush allotment OF sr DUE ON 4/11/16 Attachments: SR tender enquiry for HPPA Collar Bush due on 04.11.15.pdf Dear Sir, We request you to please withdraw the allocation against S. Rly Tender No. 74160058 due on 04.11.16 as the tender is for only HPPA Collar Bush which is mentioned under Instructions/ Remarks	OP-3 asks other parties to withdraw their allocation against Southern Railway tender.
13.	15.11.2016	Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 to OP-7	Dear Sir, Please note that NR tender due on 18.11.2016 for 350 sets of Brake Gear Bushes allotted to both BBC and JPPL with basic rate of Rs. 5,036/  We are quoting basic rate of Rs. 5,036.00 + ED @ 6% + CST @ 5% (Rs. 5,605.07 all Incl.) in N Rly. tender due on 18.11.16. So JPPL to quote all-inclusive rate of Rs. 5,605.07. Please confirm the same.	OP-3 informs rates to be quoted in Northern Railway tender allocated to OP-3 and OP-7.
14.	06.12.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8, OP-7, OP-6, and Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10	E. Rly. Tender no. 11161074 due on 06/12/16 for 3334 sets This tender is allotted between BBC and CSL MFP (group of BBC) will quote Rs. 5,175/- per set + ED @ 6%+ CST @ 5% = Rs. 5,759.77 all inclusive CSL will quote Rs. 5,155/- per set + ED @ 6% + GST @5% = Rs. 737.51 all inclusive Non allotties should quote minimum 8% higher than PLR"	Prices to be quoted by OP-3 and OP-6 and other OPs in Eastern Railway tender are fixed by Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5. She also indicates the percentage by which the non-allotties should quote higher than PLR.
15.	21.12.2016	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8, OP-7, OP-6, and Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10	Subject: Bush allotment Attachments: Bush AC-1.xls New Allotment of N Rly. tenders due on 23/12/16	Ms. Shanta Sohoni circulates allocation table allotting forthcoming Northern Railway tenders along with Price List Rates





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
				amongst the OPs.
16.	16.01.2017	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, OP-6, OP-7, and Mr. RK. Singh of OP-	Subject: New allotment of Bushes Attachments: Bush Ac-1.xls Tenders distributed between 3 firms should mutually discuss and quote the tenders. Non-allottees should quote minimum 8% higher than PLR	Ms. Shanta Sohoni states that tenders are allocated between 03 entities and they should mutually discuss and quote. She also sends as attachment revised Price List Rates, list of approved suppliers for HPPA Bushes and SLPR Bushes, and allocation of tenders.
17.	17.02.2017	Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	Dear Sir/ Madam  WE are not able to quote the RCF tender 2301160616 due on 23.2.17 allotted to us as it doesn't allow us to quote, same time we are also not able to quote in the W rly tender due on 22.2.17.  We will ensure that RCF and W rly add our firm name in their future tenders so that we can quote.  We request you to kindly change the allotment and allot us SCR tender due on 1.3.2017 allot them the RCF tender and oblige.	OP-8 requests for allotment of different tender than those allotted but Ms. Shanta Sohoni declines the
	17.02.2017	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8	Dear Sir, We have not allotted below mentioned both tenders to your a/c. RCF tender is allotted to Quadrant & W. Rly. tender is allotted to BBC. So, allotment will remain same.	request made by OP-8.
18.	24.02.2017	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, and OP-7	Subject: Bush Ac-1.xls Attachments: Bush Ac-1.xls As requested by Jai Polypan, we have allotted entire quantity of WCR tender No. 30171157 due on 28/3/17 is allotted to BBC.	Ms. Shanta Sohoni allocates entire quantity of West Central Railway





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
			BBC should quote for entire tender quantity.  Jai Polypan will quote higher rate in this tender and their shortfall will be adjusted in the next tender.	tender to OP-3 on request of OP-7. She asks OP-7 to quote higher rate in the
	24.03.2017	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, OP-6, OP-7, and Mr. RK. Singh of OP-10	Pl. note that WCR tenders 30171156 & 30171157 due on 28/3/17 both tenders are allotted to CSL  Non-allotties should quote minimum 8% higher than PLR	tender and their shortfall would be adjusted in next tender. Ms. Shanta Sohoni also sends as attachment
	24.03.2017	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, OP-6, OP-7, and Mr. RK. Singh of OP- 10	ER tender due on 6/12/16 was allotted between BBC and CSL. 3250 sets finalized in favour of BBC and bal. qty. dropped and CSL is not received any order. Hence, WCR tender No. 30171156 due on 28.3.17 has been allotted to CSL. BBC is requested to quote minimum 8% higher than PLR.	revised Price List Rates, list of approved suppliers for HPPA Bushes and SLPR Bushes, and allocation of tenders and share.  Thereafter, Ms. Shanta Sohoni re-allocates West Central railway tenders to OP-6 as Eastern Railway tender allotted to OP-3 and OP-6 was finalised only in favour of OP-3 and OP-6 had received nothing. Hence, Ms. Shanta Sohoni requests OP-3 to quote higher in West Central Railway tender.





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
19.	01.04.2017	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, OP-6, OP-7, and Mr. RK. Singh of OP-	Subject: New Allotment of Bushes. Attachments: Bush AC-1.xls	Ms. Shanta Sohoni sends as attachment revised Price List Rates, list of approved suppliers for HPPA Bushes and SLPR Bushes, and allocation of tenders and share.
20.	02.05.2017	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, and OP-7	Subject: Bush AC-2.xls Attachments: Bush Ac-2.xls As per latest RDSO's Vendor Directory published on 18th April 2017, following firms are Approved Vendors 1. M/s. Polyset Plastics Pvt. Ltd. (for HPPA) 2. M/s. Power Mould (for HPPA) 3. M/s. Jai Polypan Pvt. Ltd. (for HPPA) 4. M/s. Black Burn & Co. Pvt. Ltd. (for SLPR) 5. M/s. Moulded Fibreglass Products (for SLPR) Business share will be distributed between above 5 firms. Each firm will get 20% share Therefore PPPL 40% BBC: 40% JPPL:20% Tenders opened after 01/05/2017 is allotted accordingly.	Ms. Shanta Sohoni provides list of approved vendors as on 18.04.2017 and provides business share for each firm. She sends as attachment revised Price List Rates, list of approved suppliers for HPPA Bushes and SLPR Bushes, and allocation of tenders and share.
21.	03.06.2017	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-3, OP-7, and OP-10	Subject: Revised allotment of HPPA Bush Attachments: Bush Ac-2.xls Dear All, M/s. Quadrant Surlon got approval as "Approved Vendors" Therefore, we have worked out individual share including M/s. Quadrant and allotment of pending bushes has been revised. All are requested to quote the rates as per revised allotment.	Ms. Shanta Sohoni notes that OP-10 has also received approval and therefore, provides revised Price List Rates, list of approved suppliers for





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
				HPPA Bushes and SLPR
				Bushes, and allocation of
				tenders and list of allocated
				share.
				Ms. Shanta Sohoni informs
			California David Allatin and	the OPs of addition of OP-
			Subject: Bush Allotment Attachments: Bush Ac-2.xls	4 as Part-I Vendor and
		Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr.	Our firm M/s. Anju Techno Industries is upgraded as "Approved Vendor" w.e.f.	provides as attachment
22.	13.06.2017	Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, OP-7,	12/06/2017.	revised Price List Rates,
22.	13.00.2017	and Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10	Now, total approved vendors are seven (7)	list of approved suppliers
			Share for each firm has been revised and allotment for future tenders are done accordingly.  We have done some changes in the earlier allotted tenders.	for HPPA Bushes and
			All are requested to quote the tenders as per revised allotment	SLPR Bushes, and
				allocation of tenders and
				share.
		Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3 to		Mr. Alok Somani asks
		Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5, Mr.	BBCPL's allocation in developmental sources should be for 2 firms	allotment as Part II vendors
	19.06.2017	Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, OP-6,	<ul><li>a) Skylark as developmental source in PR bushes</li><li>b) BBCPL as developmental source in HPPA bushes</li></ul>	to be made for both OP-11
		Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8, OP-		for SLPR Bushes and OP-3
		7, and Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10		for HPPA Bushes.
23.			Subject: Allotment of Brake gear bushes	Ms. Shanta Sohoni states
		Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr.	Attachments: Bush Ac-2.xls	that allotment would be
	19.06.2017	Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, OP-6,	Dear All, It is decided that we will make allotment for Approved Vendors as well as Development	made for both Part I and
	12.00.2017	Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8, OP-	Vendors.	Part II Vendors and players
		7, and Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10	Account for Approved Vendor is worked out on the basis of 80% of the tender quantity and	who have not been allotted
			Account for Development Vendor is worked out on the basis of 20% of the tender quantity.	anything in a tender, would





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
5. 140.	Date	E-man (10 and F10m)	Development Vender should quote 2.5% less than PLR for allotted firms  Non-allotties should quote minimum 8% higher than PLR.	quote minimum 8% higher than Price List Rate. She also provides as attachment revised Price List Rates, list of approved suppliers for HPPA Bushes and SLPR Bushes, and allocation of tenders and
	21.06.2017	Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5  Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8 to	Dear All Have quoted in SWR tender due tomorrow according to the PLR Subject: Re: Allotment of WSWR tender due 27/6/18 Attachments: SWR Brake Gear Bush Comparative statement 22.6.17.pdf Dear All,	share.  Mr. Harsha Gumballi writes to Ms. Shanta Sohoni with CC to other OPs that though it had quoted in South Western
24.	27.00.2017	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	South Western Rly tender opened on 22.6.17 was allotted to us but was quoted less by Blackburn and Calstar.  Please update the CPO accordingly.	Railway tender as per Price List Rate circulated, it did
	21.07.2017	Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	Dear All We request you to kindly update the CPO as we are not L1 in our allotted tender SWR 301 71250A opened on 22.6.17 We have not quoted in the other tender no 15160656 W Rly opened on 3.7.2017. Kindly do the needful.	not get the tender which was given to OP-3 and OP-6 who quoted below their decided prices. Hence, allocation sheet be updated accordingly.
25.	09.08.2017	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	Dear Sir, For negotiation of HPPA Bushes of WR Tender No. 15160657 opened on 4/5/17, Mr. Bafna has spoken to Mr. Somani and decided that M/s Moulded Fibre will send letter giving revised rate of Rs. 1,970/- basic + GST @ 5% extra.	Ms. Shanta Sohoni states that based on discussion between Mr. Bhupesh





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
			M/s Power Mould will attend the meeting and giving the same revised rate.	Bafna of OP-2/ OP-4/ OP-5
				and Mr. Alok Somani of
				OP-1/ OP-3, OP-1 will
				quote revised rate and OP-
				2 will quote same rate in
				negotiations in respect of
				Western Railway tender.
				Ms. Shanta Sohoni states
				that high value tenders
		Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr.	Dear Sir, It is difficult to finalise the tender when both companies rates are same and it is looking like cartel between both the firms.  Therefore, it is decided that high value tenders will be divided 60:40 ratio.	would be split in 60:40
				ratio as it was difficult to
				finalise tenders if both
				companies quote same
26.	17.08.2017	Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	In the ECR tender we will quote Rs. $4.581/-+GST @ 5\% = Rs. 4.810.05$ per set all inclusive.	price and it would indicate
		Tarkeshwar Thakur Of Of -3	You are requested to quote Rs. 4,590/- + GST @ $5\%$ = Rs. 4,819.50 per set all inclusive.	cartel between them. She
			So, you will get counter offer of our rate for 40% quantity and easy to Rly. officer for	also provides rates to be
			finalisation of tender.	quoted by OP-3 and OP-5
			Pl. confirm,	in Eastern Central Railway
				tender for OP-5 to receive
				40% quantity.
			Subject: New Allotment of Brake gear Bushes	Ms. Shanta Sohoni revises
		Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr.	Attachments: Bush Ac-2.xls Dear All,	price list rates w.e.f.
27.	04.12.2017	R.K. Singh of OP-10, and OP-7	We are revising our Price List rates w.e.f. 01/12/2017.	01.12.2017 and sends as
		K.K. Singh of Of -10, and OF-/	Therefore, all are requested to quote revised rates for tenders opening after 01/12/2017.	attachment revised Price
			Allotment is done with revised rates only.	List Rates, list of approved





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)					Conte	ent of E	-mail		Observation
											suppliers for HPPA Bushes and SLPR Bushes, and allocation of tenders and share.
			Pleas S.	Madan e find b Rlv	elow status	s of ECoR	Tender .	Qty	PO recd.	ned on 18.08.17 Remarks	
28.	05.12.2017	Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	No. 1.	ECoR	No. 03171811	18.08.17	Qty 3361 sets	allotted  1075 sets	for Qty.  1042 sets	1075 sets allotted to us but PO has been received by us for only 1042 Sets. Hence 33 sets should be considered as dropped & value should be reversed from our A/C. Please update the allocation sheet accordingly.	OP-3 requests dropping amount to reflect reduction in purchase order actually made; however, OP-5
20.			devel value	opment should		Hence we	request			us but POs have been placed on ider these tenders as dropped &	refuses and states that if 100% order is placed on OP-3, full amount will be
	06.12.2017	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	We he As pe where becau	Dear Sir, We have updated your ECoR record. As per your statement, all these orders are finalized in favour of BBC i.e. your firm and where 100% order is placed on your firm, those tender will be taken in your account because your quoted rates are less than 15-20% lower than PLR and therefore, these tenders are not finalized on Approved supplier.					reflected in its account.		
29.	20.12.2017	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, OP-7, and Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10	Single vende We ar tende	nent for e tender or" and re accor	not in "De unting 80% ted to appr	to BBC sh ev. Source 6 tender q	ould que ". uantity a	ınd allott	ed to App	hich is approved for "Approved roved Vendors Only. Therefore, e from their "Dev. Source firm"	Ms. Shanta Sohoni makes allocation for new tenders. OP-3 makes it clear that it is now a Part I vendor and not Part II vendor. OP-7





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
	21.12.2017	Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	<ol> <li>Please note the following:-         <ol> <li>That we are not in the pool for developmental source and this has been our stance right from the beginning.</li> <li>As you all know, we are offering much lesser rates from developmental source irrespective of whether the allocation for approved source is in our favour.</li> <li>We do not pursue with railways to place order on developmental source bypassing higher offer of approved sources.</li> <li>If despite not pursuing, railways offer full quantity on developmental source, we cannot help it.</li> </ol> </li> </ol>	requests that Part II sources should also run in pool just like Part I sources effective from 01.01.2018.
	22.12.2017	OP-7 to Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3, and Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	Dear Sir, Only 3 firms are in development source. Pl. make pool in dev. source also to avoid any disturbance in getting orders of approved vendors. Otherwise, no meaning to run approved sources pool.  4. Our humble request is that all the dev. source should run under pool with effect from 1st January 2018.	
	28.12.2017	Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	Dear Madam, We have a huge shortfall in the accounting period 1.6.16 to 28.11.16. Details are attached. Please incorporate the same in the accounts and make future allocations accordingly.	OP-3 requests Ms. Shanta Sohoni to make future allocations to it in view of
30.	29.12.2017	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	Dear Sir, Now, we have accounted tenders w.e.f. 01/05/2017 and therefore we cannot update earlier tender position in this statement.	the fact that it had huge shortfall in accounting period 01.06.2016 to 28.11.2016. Ms. Shanta Sohoni however, refuses.
31.	15.01.2018	Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 to Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3	Sir, NER Tender No. 22160770A due on 19.01.2018 for 8335 Sets of Brake Gear Bushes is allotted to both PPPL (60% of 80% qty) & BBC (40% of 80% qty) @ Rs. 2,714. 00 per set basic. Please advise what rate both of us to quote.	OP-3 asks OP-5 to tell the rate to be quoted in North Eastern Railway tender. Ms. Shanta Sohoni replies





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
	15.01.2018	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur and Mr. Alok Somani of OP-3	Dear Sir, Polyset will quote Rs. 2,714/- per set + GST @ $5\%$ = Total Rs. 2,849.70 per set all incl. BBC will quote Rs. 2,725/- per set + GST @ $5\%$ = Total Rs. 2,861.25 per set all incl. Pl. confirm the same	with the rates to be quoted.
32.	21.04.2018	Mr. Rajeev Dudhani of OP-7 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, and Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10	Mam, We are not interested in NFR (Dibrugarh) (due on 24/4/18) tender. Pl. allot other firm and remove this amount from our account.  Best regards Rajeev Dudhani	Mr. Rajeev Dudhani of OP- 7 states that OP-7 is not interested in North Western Railway tender allocated to
	21.04.2018	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-7, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, and Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10	Dear Sir, Due to shortfall this Tender is allotted to you. There is no choice, but to request you to quote for this tender	it. But Ms. Shanta Sohoni states that due to shortfall, this tender was allocated to it and there are no choices.
33.	24.04.2018	Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 to Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3	Sir, E. Rly. Tender No. 11171082A due on 01.05.2018 for 3013 Sets of Brake Gear Bushes is allotted to both BBC (60% of 80% qty) & PPPL (40% of 80% qty) @ Rs. 5,429.00 per set basic. Please advise what rate BBC & PPPL should quote. This is re-tender. In earlier tender opened on 20.12.17, BBC had quoted Rs. 5,329.00 per set basic.	OP-3 writes to Ms. Shanta Sohoni that Eastern Railway tender is allocated between itself and OP-5
	24.04.2018	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	Sir, E. Rly. Tender No. 11171082A due on 01.05.2018 for 3013 Sets of Brake Gear Bushes.  BBC will quote Rs. 5,429/-per set + GST @5% = Total Rs. 5,700.45  PPPL will quote Rs. 5,445/- per set + GST @5% = Total Rs. 5717.25	and so what rates should be quoted. Ms. Shanta Sohoni provides rates to be quoted.
34.	07.06.2018	Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5, OP-7, and Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10	Dear Madam, NR tender due on 08.06.18 for 750 sets is floated by AMV/ LKO and would not be split 60/40. Therefore, we request for change in allocation either 80% in our favor or 80% in favor of Quadrant.	OP-3 requests Ms. Shanta Sohoni for changes in allocation of Northern
	07.06.2018	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, and	BBC is requested to quote higher rate in NR-AMV tender. We will account this tender in Quadrant account.	Railway tender between itself and OP-10. Ms.





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
		Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10		Shanta Sohoni obliges.
35.	20.06.2018	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	CR Tender No. 38182236 due on 02-07-18 is allotted between PPPL and BBC PPPL will quote Rs. 2,952/- + GST @5% = Rs. 3,099.60 per set (all incl.)  BBC will quote Rs. 2,962/- + GST @5% = Rs. 3,110.10 per set (all incl.)  Pl. confirm	Ms. Shanta Sohoni provides rates to be quoted by OP-5 and OP-3 in Central Railways tender.
36.	11.07.2018	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	NFR tender 30181001 due on 16/07/2018 is allotted between BBC and PPPL BBC will quote Rs. 5,774/- + GST @5% = Rs. 6,062.70 per set (all incl.) PPPL will quote Rs. 5,765/- + GST @5% = Rs. 6,053.25 per set (all incl.) Pl. confirm	Ms. Shanta Sohoni provides rates to be quoted by OP-3 and OP-5 in
30.	11.07.2018	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	Revised  BBC will quote Rs. 5,774/- + GST @5% = Rs. 6,062.70 per set (all inc1)  PPPL will quote Rs. 5,783.50 + GST @5% = Rs. 6,072.67 per set (all incl.)  Pl. confirm	North-East Frontier Railway tender.
37.	01.09.2018	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	Dear Sir, NWR Tender No. 30182151D due on 04-09-18 for 2549 sets allotted between PPPL and BBC Polyset will quote Rs. 6,057/- + GST @5% = Rs. 6,359.85 per set (all inclusive) BBC will quote Rs. 6,075/- + GST @5% = Rs. 6,378.75 per set (all inclusive) Pl. confirm the same	Ms. Shanta Sohoni provides rates to be quoted by OP-3 and OP-5 in North Western Railway tender.
38.	30.11.2018	Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 to Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3	Sir, W. Rly. Tender No. 15180683 due on 06.12.2018 for 2,52,148 Nos. Brake Gear Bushes (Item-3) is allotted to both PPPL (60% of 80% qty) & BBC (40% of 80% I qty) @ Rs. 33.50 per no. basic. Please advise what rate BBC should quote in this tender.	OP-3 seeks advice from Ms. Shanta Sohoni on price to be quoted in Western Railway tender allocated
	30.11.2018	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur and Mr. Alok Somani of OP-3	Dear Sir, Polyset will quote Rs. 33.50 per pc. + GST @ 5% and BBC will quote 33.60 per pc. + GST @ 5% Pl. confirm	between OP-3 and OP-5. Ms. Shanta Sohoni provides prices to be quoted.





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
39.	04.01.2019	Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 to OP-7	Dear Sir, SER Tender No. 30181434A due on 07.01.2019 for 2013 Sets of Brake Gear Bushes is allotted to both BBC (60% of 80% qty) & JPPL (40% of 80% qty) @ Rs. 6,058.00 per set basic So in this tender, we will quote list price i.e. Rs. 6,058.00 per set basic. You are advised to quote Rs. 6,065.00 per set basic. Please confirm.	OP-3 advises OP-7 the rate quotation for South Eastern Railway tender, which OP-
	04.01.2019	OP-7 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	Dear Sir, OK agreed. We will quote R& 6065 per set basic + GST as suggested by you.	7 agrees to.
40.	08.01.2019	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10, Mr. Ram Chandra of OP-6, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, and OP-7	Subject: New allotment of Bushes Attachments: Bush Ac-2.xls	Ms. Shanta Sohoni sends as attachment revised Price List Rates, list of approved suppliers for HPPA Bushes and SLPR Bushes, and allocation of tenders and share.
	27.02.2019	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-6, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10, and OP-7	Dear All, Calstar Steel Ltd. got approval as Approved source w.e.f. 01/03/2019 Accordingly there are now 8 approved supplier and share has been revised. We have made allotment accordingly. Non-allotties should quote minimum 8 higher than PLR Non-allotties should quote minimum 8-10% higher than PLR	Ms. Shanta Sohoni states that as OP-6 is now also Part-I Vendor, so shares are re-allocated accordingly.
41.	27.02.2019	Mr. Luv Kumar of OP-10 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5, OP-6, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10, and OP-7	Please increase prices in order to compensate	However, Mr. Luv Kumar of OP-10 and Mr. Bhupesh Bafna of OP-2/ OP-4/ OP-5 want higher prices for compensating lesser
	27.02.2019	Mr. Bhupesh Bafna of OP-2/ OP-4/ OP-5 to Mr. Luv Kumar and Mr.	I am in agreement with Luv Kumar	compensating lesser allocated share.





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
		R.K. Singh of OP-10, Ms. Shanta		
		Sohoni of OP-5, OP-6, Mr.		
		Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, and		
		OP-7		
42.	02.03.2019	Mr. Vikas Aggarwal of OP-6 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	Dear Sir, We would like to bring to attention of all that we have presently agreed to give supporting quotation up to 20-03-2019 till an all-party meeting is called and all pending issues are decided. We shall request the administrator to call for a meeting at the earliest possible. Regards, VA(CSL)	OP-6 states that it would provide supporting quotations until 20.03.2019 till all-party meeting is called.
43.	18.03.2019	Mr. Rajeev Dudhani of OP-7 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, OP-6, and Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10	Dear all, Pl. note that NWR-JU tender retendered on 25/03/2019. Kindly revise the allocation of this tender to us. Regards Rajeev Dudhani	OP-7 requests allocation of North Western Railway tender to it as it has been re-tendered.
44.	26.03.2019	Mr. Rajeev Dudhani of OP-7 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10, and OP-6	Dear All, As you all are aware that Calstar was got approval of Approved Vendor on 07/01/2019 and they are getting orders of ER & SER tenders opened on 07/01/2019 So kindly re-check the accounts and issue excess & shortages. We are in a loss of around 2.5 crores during 2018-2019 F. Y. How we can full fill our losses. We request your valued comments in this matter Best Regards Rajeev Dudhani	OP-7 states that as OP-6 has become approved vendor, re-checking of excess and shortages is required as OP-7 has suffered losses. He also
	05.04.2019	Mr. Rajeev Dudhani of OP-7 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, Mr.	Subject: Re: Allotment of new tenders Attachments: comparative of L-parel HPPA tender.pdf Dear All, Pl. see comparative statement of today's HPPA tender. It was allocated to JPPL. But	states that OP-6 underquoted in Western Railway tender.





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
		R.K. Singh of OP-10, and OP-6	Calstar underquoted.  How we can run adjustment between all firm. We are in loss of 2.75 crores in this adjustment of business.  You all are requested to comment on this matter.  Regards  Rajeev Dudhani	
45.	08.04.2019	Mr. Rajesh Nair of OP-7 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	Dear Sir,  JFPL & BBC are allotted NWR tender due on 10/04/2019 (60%+40%)  JPPL will quote PLR (i.e. 6,058/- Basic + 5% GST)  BBC will quote Rs. 6,067/- Basic + 5% GST  Kindly confirm the above rate immediately  Thanks & Regards  Rajesh Nair  Subject: Bush Allotment	OP-7 provides rates to be quoted by itself and OP-3 for North Western Railway tender. However, as tender date got extended, Ms. Shanta Sohoni changed allocation
	12.04.2019	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, OP-6, Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10, and OP-7	Attachments: Bush Ac-3.xls  Due date for NWR tender is postponed to 19/04/2019  Allocation for NWR tender is changed.  All are requested to quote strictly as per allocation.  Non-allotties should quote minimum 8-10% higher than PLR	for the tender. She sends as attachment revised Price List Rates, and allocation of tenders and share.
46.	28.05.2019	Mr. Rajeev Dudhani of OP-7 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, OP-6, and Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10	Mam, Please note that as per information received from NER for tender No. 10191100 opened on 11/03/2019 has cancelled due to quantity received to consignee against earlier tender/order.  Kindly remove this amount from our account. Pl. update the account Regards Rajeev Dudhani	OP-7 informs that as one North Eastern Railway tender allocated to it has been cancelled, same be removed from its account.
47.	25.07.2019	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10, Mr. Ram	Subject: Bush allotment Attachments: Bush AC-3.xls Dear All,	Ms. Shanta Sohoni sends as attachment, revised Price





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
		Chandra of OP-6, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, and OP-7	We have made some changes in the earlier allotment. All are requested to quote the tenders as per revised allotment	List Rates, and allocation of tenders and share.
48.	03.08.2019	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	N. Rly. tender No. 07191 774 due on 08-08-2019 for 6526 sets of Brake gear bushes This tender is allotted between PPPL and BBC PPPL will quote Rs. 6,192/- per set + GST @5% = Rs. 6,501.60 per set (all incl.) BBC will quote Rs. 6,205/- per set + GST @5% = Rs. 6,515.25 per set (all incl.). Pl. confirm the same	Ms. Shanta Sohoni provides rates to be quoted in Northern Railway tender allocated between OP-3 and OP-5.
49.	08.08.2019	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-7	Attn: Shri Rajiv Dudhani/Shri Rajesh Nair As per allocation, this tender was allotted between Polyset and Black Burn. How Jai Polypan has quoted lower rate i.e. 5-6% lower than PLR. You are requested to withdraw your offer immediately under intimation to us Otherwise it will be difficult to run the pool.	OP-5 asks OP-7 as to how has it underquoted in Northern Railway tender
	08.08.2019	Mr. Bhupesh Bafna of OP-2/ OP-4/ OP-5 to OP-7	Dear Vishalbhai Whatever be the reason for underquoting, we request you to withdraw your offer immediately otherwise the pool may break.	and requests it to withdraw it offer.
50.	13.08.2019	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10, Mr. Ram Chandra of OP-6, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, and OP-7	Subject: New allotment of Bushes Attachments: Bush Ac-3.xls Dear all, Pl. do not break the PLR and underquote any of the tender which is not allotted to you Feel free for discussion of any tender allotment. We will try to update your suggestions if possible. Non-allotties should quote strictly 8-10% higher than PLR. Regards	Ms. Shanta Sohoni asks the OPs to not break Price List Rate or underquote. Further, as attachment, she sends revised Price List Rates and allocation of tenders and share.
51.	03.10.2019	Mr. Ram Chandra of OP-6 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	Dear All, We shall be quoting the following rates in N.F. Railway Tener No. 30190409 Due on 09-10- 2019 Qty — 8291 Nos.  Consignee QTY Basic Rate Freight GST All-inclusive rate DBRT Workshop 709 Nos. 90/- 30/- 12% 134.40 KIR GSD 196 Nos. 90/- 50/- 12% 156.80	OP-6 provides to Ms. Shanta Sohoni, the rates OP-6 would quote in North Frontier Railway tender





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
			NBQ Workshop       802 Nos.       90       25/-       12%       128.00         PNO GSD       6584 Nos.       90/-       10/-       12%       112.00         All non-allotties are requested to quote 8-10% higher.	
	05.09.2019	Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 to Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10	Dear Sir, ER Tender No. 11191074 due on 09.09.19 for 5016 Sets of Brake Gear Bushes is allotted to both BBC (60% of 80% qty,) & Quadrant (40% of 80% qty) @ Rs. 6,058.00 per set basic So in this tender, we will quote list price i.e. Rs. 6,058.00 per set basic You are advised to quote Rs. 6,075. 00 per set basic Please confirm	OP-3 provides rates to be quoted in Eastern Railway
	05.09.2019	Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	OK	tender allocated to OP-3 and OP-10, to OP-10.
52.	09.09.2019	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10 and Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	We have discussed with Polymer Products and they have agreed that they will quote 8% higher than PLR (PLR Rs. 6,058/- + GST @5%)  You both are requested to quote PLR and do not reduce the price    ER	Ms. Shanta Sohoni states that OP-8 has agreed to quote higher in this tender. OP-10 thereafter asks OP-3 as to why did it underquote
	09.09.2019	Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	Subject: Re: ER Tender No. 11191074 due on 09.09.19 for 5016 Sets of Brake Gear Bushes Attachments: Eastern Railway – HPPA Bush (09.09.19).pdf Dear Mr. Thakur, Can you please let us know why you have under quoted in ER tender from the rates as agreed below	than rates agreed.
53.	11.09.2019	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Ram Chandra of OP-6, Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8, and OP-7	Attachments: MOM.pdf; Bush Ac-4.xls Minutes of Meeting Meeting was held at Mumbai on 10/09/2019. Members were present: 1. Shri Bhupesh Bafna: M/s. Polyset Plastics Pvt. Ltd. 2. Shri Vishal Baid: M/s. Jai Polypan Pvt. Ltd. 3. Shri Alok Somani: M/s. Black Burn & Co. Pvt. Ltd. 4. Shri R. K. Singh: M/s. Quadrant EPC Surlon India Ltd.	Ms. Shanta Sohoni circulates Minutes of Meeting held on 10.09.2019 at Mumbai, in which discussions pertaining to approved





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
5.110.	12.09.2019	Mr. Ram Chandra of OP-6 to Ms.	Following points agreed:  1. M/s. Calstar Steel Ltd got approval as "Approved Vender" for supply of HPPA Brake gear bushes w.e.f. 07/01/2019. Hence orders for CSL will be accounted for tender opened on and after 07/01/2019. Accordingly statement will be circulated and close the account up to 22/08/2019 (Bush Ac-3)  2. M/s. Polymer Products of India got approval as "Approved Vendor" for supply of HPPA Brake gear bushes w.e.f. 23/08/2019. Therefore, New account generated with earlier excess/shortage including Polymer Products in the pool. Tender opened on and after 23/08/2019 where Polymer is L1 will be accounted. (Bush Ac 4)  3. PLR will be increased © 5% w.e.f. 11th September 2019.  4. Now M/s. Moulded Fibre Glass Products is only the firm under "Dev Source". Shri Somani is agreed that henceforth, they will quote approx. 5% less than PLR in M/s. Moulded Fibre.  Further, if 100% P0 awarded to "Dev. Source", same will be accounted in the pool.  Dear Sir,  We are sorry for not being able to cone to the meeting.  We find that the distribution which was already disproportionate has become even more	vendors and rates to be revised were provided. Further, she sends as revised Price List Rates, and allocation of tenders and share. OP-6 replies apologising for not being able to attend meeting and states that after upgradation of OP-8, distribution which was already disproportionate, has become even more skewed.
		Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	skewed with the up gradation of Polymer Products, and we are not getting a fair share. So in all fairness both Pt-II and Pt-I quantity should be taken into account for calculation of individual share.	
54.	18.09.2019	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10	Dear Sir, C. Rly. tender No. 38192236 opened on 17/09/2019 was allotted between Polyset and Calstar But your firm has quoted lower rate. Pl. explain why? If we have to run the pool, such mistakes are not acceptable. You are requested to withdraw your offer immediately and send withdrawal letter copy in the pool for confirmation	Ms. Shanta Sohoni seeks explanation from OP-10 for quoting lower rate in Central Railway tender and asks it to withdraw. Mr.
	19.09.2019	Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	Subject: Re: C. Rly. Tender No. 38192236 due 17-09-19 Attachment: CR-CSTM.pdf Please find herewith attached our request submitted to Central Railway for withdrawal of	R.K. Singh of OP-10 withdraws from tender.





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
			our offer for the below said tender. This is for your kind information please	
55.	19.09.2019	WhatsApp chats between Mr. Bhupesh Bafna of OP-2/ OP-4/ OP-5 and Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3	Bhupesh Bafna: Sir, we both need to agree on some changes in the distribution % of FIPPA share of business otherwise this business will become non profitable & then will be very difficult to revive.  So its my request to you to agree with what I'm proposing.  Alok Somani: What r u proposing?  Bhupesh Bafna: Sending you in a few minutes  Bhupesh Bafna: Polyset Group-25%, Blackburn group-25% (including both Pt-I & Pt-II share), Other 4 - 12.5% each  Alok Somani: Better to call a meeting again  Bhupesh Bafna: I have spoken to all.  They are not inclined to continue the  Its only the ratio issue otherwise everything is going fine. I personally believe that the pool & prices will break if we both don't agree with the above formula	Mr. Bhupesh Bafna of OP- 2/ OP-4/ OP-5 proposes revision of share from what has been earlier decided in meeting.
	21.09.2019		Alok Somani: As per Mumbai meeting our percentage share worked out to 37.8% including provisionally approved firm. PPL's share worked out to 26.7%. While you are willing to let go 1.7% of your share you want us to forego 12.8%. Is that logical? You need to rethink Bhupesh	
	26.09.2019		Bhupesh Bafna: If we do proper detailed calculation then the breakup should be BBC 29%, PPPL 21%, Calstar 12.50%, JPPL 12.50%, Polymer 12.50%, Quadrant 12.50%, Total 100%  If this is agreeable to you then I will put it up on HPPA group	
56.	30.09.2019	Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5, OP-7, Mr. Ram Chandra of OP-6, Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8, and Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10	SECR Tender No. 03182030A due on 01.10.19 is allotted to BBC @ Rs. 35.25 basic. Since GST rate of HPPA Bushes has been increased from 5% to 12% w.e.f. 01.10.19, we will quote Rs. 35.25 + GST @12% (Rs. 39.48 all incl.) All are requested to quote their rates accordingly	OP-3 informs other parties that South-East Central Railway tender has been allocated to it so all other parties should quote accordingly.





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
57.	30.09.2019	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	As per latest discussion, pool will work out on 100% tender value w.e.f. 01/10/2019 You are requested to quote higher rate in NR tender due 01/10/2019 in part II firm Other tender allocation will be sending by evening	Ms. Shanta Sohoni asks OP-3 to quote higher rate in Northern Railway tender as Part II firm
58.	30.09.2019	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, Mr. Ram Chandra of OP-6, Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10, Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8, and OP-7	Subject: Bush Allotment Attachments: Bush Ac-5.xls; Bush AC-4.xls Dear All, As per discussion had with group members, working will be done on 100% tender value. Ratio for all members are as under w.e.f. 01/10/2019. Polyset: 21%, BBC: 29%, JPPL: 12.5%, Quadrant: 12.5%, CSL: 12.5%, Polymer: 12.5% Total: 100% Allotment w.e.f. 01/10/2019 is done on the basis of above ratio. Due to withdrawal of Quadrant's offer against CR tender opened on 17/09/2019 and discussion had with Dy. CMM, CR, this tender will be retendered in October 19 therefore, we have not accounted this tender in the statement. All are requested to quote as per allocation with new PLR Non-allotties should quote minimum 8-10% higher than PLR. "AS PER PRESS RELEASE ISSUED BY GST COUNCIL, MINISTY OF FINANCE, GST RATE @ 12% WILL BE APPLICABLE FOR CHAPTER 86 OF WAGON, COACHES AND ROLLING STOCK ITEMS W.E.F. 01/10/2019" All are requested to quote GST @ 12% for bush tenders.	Ms. Shanta Sohoni provides to parties their ratio of allocation w.e.f. 01.10.2019 and asks parties to quote as per Price List Rates. She also requests parties to quote GST @ 12%. Further, as attachment, she sends revised Price List Rates and allocation of tenders and revised share.
59.	30.09.2019	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Ram Chandra of OP-6, Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10, Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, and OP-7	Subject: Bush Ac-5.xls Attachments: Bush Ac-5.xls ER tender No. 11191686 due on 04/10/2019 quantity is in 2135 sets (32 Nos. in one set) and PL rate is Rs. 1,128/- per set + GST @5%. All are requested to quote the rate in per set and quote 8% to 10% higher than PLR.	Ms. Shanta Sohoni asks OPs to quote decided rates in Eastern Railway tender. She also sends as attachment, revised Price List Rates, and allocation





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation		
				of tenders and share.		
60.	03.10.2019	Mr. Ram Chandra of OP-6 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5	Subject: N.F. Railway Tender No. 30190409 due on 09-10-19 for Mfg. & Supply of Brake         Gear Bush to RDSO Drg. No. SKETCH-81039, Item -7         Dear All,         We shall be quoting the following rates in N.F. Railway Tender No. 30190409 due on 09-10-2019 Qty- 8291 Nos.         Consignee       QTY         Basic rate       Freight         GST       All-inclusive rate         DBRT       709 No         Workshop       30/-         KIRGSD       196 Nos.         90/-       50/-         12%       156.80         NBQ       802 Nos.         90/-       25/-         Workshop       10/-         PNO GSD       6584 Nos.         90/-       10/-         All non-allotties are requested to quote 8-10% higher.	OP-6 provides rates to be quoted for North-East Frontier Railway tender.		
	04.10.2019	Sent by Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to OP-8	Dear Sir, We have clearly mentioned in the email dt. 30/09/2019 that PL rate for ER tender No. 11191686 due on 04/10/2019 quantity is in 2135 sets is Rs. 1,128/- + GST 5% As per tabulation statement, you have quoted this tender today morning at 10.28 am and quoted for single pc. Rate and tender is for set of 32 pcs. You are requested to withdraw your offer immediately i.e. today with copy to be sent in the pool.	Ms. Shanta Sohoni informs that OP-8 has misquoted in		
61.	04.10.2019	Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8 to Mr. Vikas Agarwal and Mr. Ram Chandra of OP-6, Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur and Mr. Alok Somani of OP-3, Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10, Mr. Bhupesh Bafna of OP-2/ OP-4/ OP-5, and Mr. Vishal Baid and Mr.	Subject: Re: FW: Bush Ac-5.xls Attachments: E Rly BGB offer withdrawal.PDF Dear Sir/ Madam, Please find enclosed withdrawal letter. We will submit the same at the earliest.	Eastern Railway tender and asks it to withdraw. OP-8 agrees.		





S. No.	Date	Date E-mail (To and From) Content of E-mail			
		Venkat of OP-8			
62.	Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 to OP-7		Dear Sir, SR Tender No. 04190921A due on 15.11.2019 for 3729 Sets of Brake Gear Bushes is allotted to both BBC (60% of 100% qty) & JPPL (40% of 100% qty) @ Rs. 7,897. 00 per set basic So in this tender, we will quote list price i.e. Rs. 7,897.00 per set basic plus GST @12% (Rs. 8,844.64 all incl.). You are advised to quote Rs. 7,915.00 per set basic plus GST @12% (Rs. 8,864.80 all incl.) Please confirm	OP-3 and OP-7 decide their rates to be quoted in Southern Railway Tender	
	11.11.2019	Mr. Rajesh Nair of OP-7 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	Dear Sir, Agreed. We will quote Rs. 7,915 + 12% = 8,864.80 all Incl. Regards Rajesh Nair		
63.	26.11.2019	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	NER Tender No. 22190770 due 29-11-19 is allotted between PPPL & BBC PPPL will quote Rs. $3,190.50+GST$ @ $12\%=Rs.$ $3,573.36$ per set all incl. BBC will quote Rs. $3,205/-+GST$ @ $12\%=Rs.$ $3,589.60$ per set all incl. P1. confirm the same	Ms. Shanta Sohoni states that North Eastern Railway tender is allocated between OP-5 and OP-3 and provides prices to be quoted	
64.	12.12.2019	Mr. Harsha Gumballi of OP-8 to Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5, Mr. Venkata and Mr. Vishnu of OP-8 and Mr. Vikas Agarwal of OP-6	Dear All, WE would like to inform that we had quoted North East Frontier tender no WE 30190409 opened on 09.10.2019. We had quoted Rs. 80.64/- all-inclusive which is 72 basic + 12% GST which is 8.6% more that the PLR rate which is 66.25/- We have observed that initially the tender was allocated to CSL, but we were L1 as the rates quoted by CSL was Rs. 90 + 30 freight + 12% GST (All Incl. 134.40) We had no prior information about the change in rates to be quoted. We wish to know the reason for quoting higher rates	OP-8 requests for clarification as to why did OP-6 quote higher rates than decided in North-East Frontier Railway tender without any prior information.	





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail					Observation						
65.	18.01.2020	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, Mr. Harsha Gumballi and Mr. Surya of OP-8, Mr. Ram Chandra of OP-6, Mr. R.K. Singh of OP-10, and OP-7	Attac Dear SCR 66.25	Subject: SCR TENDER NO 30191446 DUE 22-1-2020 Attachments: Bush Ac-5.xls Dear All, SCR TENDER NO. 30191446 DUE 22-01-2020 Rate of the item should be read as Rs. 66.25 per pc. instead of Rs. 63/- All are requested to quote this tender accordingly.							Ms. She provides rate for South tender. She attachment List Rates of tenders a	Central e also , revise , and a	Railway sends as ed Price llocation	
	13.02.2020	Mr. Rajesh Nair of OP-7 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3 and Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/OP-3	Dear Sir  We received information from S. Rly for the below tender and found that BBC is reduced rate of Rs. 400/- per set in the negotiation and entire order is going to BBC.  Since we both are allotted in this tender and no information received so far from your side for attending negotiation and reduce rate.  All the matters have been settled during pool's last meeting and now it is very shameful matter.  How can we run such type of pool?								OP-7 expresses anguish at OP-3's non-regard to cartel			
66.			Rly	Tender No.	Due Dt.	Item	Tender Qty	Rate	Value	BBC	JPPL	arrangemen	•	
00.			04190921	15/11/2019	Kit for HPPA Brake gear bushes for 4 items as per RDSO SK- 81039 Alt. 15. Item No. 2 = 120 Nos., Item No. 3 = 76 Nos., Item no. 7 = 32 Nos., Item No.11 = 8 Nos., Bush T-3-2-808 item	3729	7897	29447913	17668748	11779165	Southern Railway which was allocaboth OP-3 and OP-7	eated to		





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
			No. 3 = 8 Nos.  Thanks & Regards, Rajesh Nair	
	25.02.2020	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3	This tender is allotted between PPPL & BBC  Polyset will quote Rs. 7,227/- + GST $12\% = Rs$ . 8,094.24 all inclusive  BBC will quote Rs. 8,094.24 + GST Nil = Rs. 8,094.24 all inclusive  Pl. confirm the same	Ms. Shanta Sohoni allocates North Central Railway tender between
67.	02.03.2020	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur and Mr. Alok Somani of OP-3	Sir, NCR tender No. 30192378 due on 02/03/2020 for 1037 sets This tender was allotted between Polyset and BBC and we have also informed you that rates to be quoted for both the firms. And the same was confirmed by you But you have not quoted the same rate and also quoted lower rates You are requested to withdraw your offer by giving copies to all pool members Regards, Polyset Plastics Pvt. Ltd Though we have informed you that both will quote the same rate	OP-3 and OP-5 and provides prices to be quoted. However, she later alleges that OP-3 has underquoted and accordingly it should withdraw its bid.
68.	12.05.2020	WhatsApp chat between Mr. Bhupesh Bafna of OP-2/ OP-4/ OP-5 and Mr. Alok Somani of OP-1/ OP-3	Bhupesh Bafna: Sir, how to go about.  Alok Somani: Can't help Not in my hands if the officer is taking time to send the draft Bhupesh Bafna: Sir, reced call from Quadrant reg. N. Rly. tender where BBC has quoted lower rate. He said that BBC should withdraw their offer today otherwise they will quote lower rate in the next tender Sir, pl do the needful.  Sir, it will be difficult to manage everyone.  Alok Somani: You can explain them the background as to why we quoted low Bhupesh Bafna: They don't have an issue that you have quoted in a tender allotted to Polyset. Issue is the prices are low.  Sir, with lots of difficulty we have maintained the prices.  Alok Somani: Prices quoted are same at which JPPL took away NR tender which was allotted to us last year	OP-3 had quoted lower in Northern Railway tender than decided. So OP-10 complained to OP-5.  Mr. Bhupesh Bafna can be seen telling this to Mr. Alok Somani and asking OP-3 to withdraw. Mr. Somani however, explains as to why OP-3





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation		
		underquoted because OP-7 took away its last tender of Northern Railway.				
	14.05.2020	Bhupesh Bafna: Sir, again I'm requesting you. Please submit your withdrawal letter. The rates are 25% lower than our PLR Hi. Hope the letter is fine It can be sent today itself Alok Somani: Not fine I will send you draft Railway officer is drafting the same Will send upon receipt Bhupesh Bafna: Ok. Sir we will send the letter Don't worry. I request you to withdraw you offer letter Sir, again I'm requesting you. Please submit your withdrawal letter. The rates are 25% lower than our PLR rates. It will effect everything. Many pool members are also requesting for the same. Hope you will do the needful				
69.	15.05.2020	Ms. Shanta Sohoni to Mr. Alok Somani and Mr. Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, Mr. Ram Chandra of OP-6, OP-7, Mr. Harsha Gumballi and Mr. Surya of OP-8, and Mr. RK. Singh of OP-10	Subject: Allotment of Brake gear bushes Attachments: Bush Ac-5.xls	Ms. Shanta Sohoni sends as attachment, revised Price List Rates and allocation of tenders.		
70.	26.05.2020	Ms. Shanta Sohoni of OP-5 to Mr.  Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, OP-7,  Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, OP-7,  Tarkeshwar Thakur of OP-3, OP-7,				





S. No.	Date	E-mail (To and From)	Content of E-mail	Observation
			3. Increase in expenses % and overheads % due to Covid 19.	
			Therefore, we suggest that we prices should be increased by 8% to 10%.	
			All are requested to send your comments on this suggestion.	